

Exhibit A

MAJORITY MEMBERS:

VIRGINIA FOXX, NORTH CAROLINA,
Chairwoman

JOE WILSON, SOUTH CAROLINA
GLENN THOMPSON, PENNSYLVANIA
TIM WALBERG, MICHIGAN
GLENN GROTHMAN, WISCONSIN
ELISE M. STEFANIK, NEW YORK
RICK W. ALLEN, GEORGIA
JIM BANKS, INDIANA
JAMES COMER, KENTUCKY
LLOYD SMUCKER, PENNSYLVANIA
BURGESS OWENS, UTAH
BOB GOOD, VIRGINIA
LISA C. MCCLAIN, MICHIGAN
MARY E. MILLER, ILLINOIS
MICHELLE STEEL, CALIFORNIA
RON ESTES, KANSAS
JULIA LETLOW, LOUISIANA
KEVIN KILEY, CALIFORNIA
AARON BEAN, FLORIDA
ERIC BURLISON, MISSOURI
NATHANIEL MORAN, TEXAS
JOHN JAMES, MICHIGAN
LORI CHAVEZ-DEREMER, OREGON
BRANDON WILLIAMS, NEW YORK
ERIN HOUGHIN, INDIANA



COMMITTEE ON
EDUCATION AND THE WORKFORCE
U.S. HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES
2176 RAYBURN HOUSE OFFICE BUILDING
WASHINGTON, DC 20515-6100

MINORITY MEMBERS:

ROBERT C. "BOBBY" SCOTT, VIRGINIA,
Ranking Member

RAÚL M. GRIJALVA, ARIZONA
JOE COURTNEY, CONNECTICUT
GREGORIO KILI CAMACHO SABLAN,
NORTHERN MARIANA ISLANDS
FREDERICA S. WILSON, FLORIDA
SUZANNE BONAMICI, OREGON
MARK TAKANO, CALIFORNIA
ALMA S. ADAMS, NORTH CAROLINA
MARK DESAULNIER, CALIFORNIA
DONALD NORCROSS, NEW JERSEY
PRAMILA JAYAPAL, WASHINGTON
SUSAN WILD, PENNSYLVANIA
LUCY MCBATH, GEORGIA
JAHANA HAYES, CONNECTICUT
ILHAN OMAR, MINNESOTA
HALEY M. STEVENS, MICHIGAN
TERESA LEGER FERNÁNDEZ,
NEW MEXICO
KATHY E. MANNING, NORTH CAROLINA
FRANK J. MRVAN, INDIANA
JAMAAL BOWMAN, NEW YORK

February 12, 2024

Dr. Minouche Shafik, President
Columbia University
202 Low Library
535 W. 116th St, Mail Code 4309
New York, NY 10027

Dr. Laura Rosenbury, President
Barnard College
219 Milbank Hall
3009 Broadway
New York, NY 10027

Mr. David Greenwald, Co-Chair
The Trustees of Columbia University
211 Low Library
535 West 116th St, Mail Code 4324
New York, NY 10027

Ms. Claire Shipman, Co-Chair
The Trustees of Columbia University
211 Low Library
535 West 116th St, Mail Code 4324
New York, NY 10027

Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein, Chair
Barnard College Board of Trustees
219 Milbank Hall
3009 Broadway
New York, NY 10027

Dear Dr. Shafik, Dr. Rosenbury, Mr. Greenwald, Ms. Shipman, and Ms. Milstein:

The Committee on Education and the Workforce (the Committee) is investigating Columbia University's response to antisemitism and its failure to protect Jewish students. We have grave concerns regarding the inadequacy of Columbia's response to antisemitism on its campus.

An environment of pervasive antisemitism has been documented at Columbia for more than two decades before the October 7, 2023, terrorist attack. In 2004, a national controversy erupted after 14 Jewish Columbia students and recent graduates recounted numerous antisemitic incidents and attitudes toward pro-Israel views from members of Columbia's Middle Eastern Studies faculty in the documentary film *Columbia Unbecoming*.¹ The allegations in the film included that one

¹ Jennifer Senior, *Columbia's Own Middle East War*, N.Y. MAG. (Jan. 19, 2005), <https://nymag.com/nymetro/urban/education/features/10868/>.

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
February 12, 2024
Page 2 of 16

Columbia professor told a student she was “not a Semite” because she had green eyes,² and that another professor asked a veteran of the Israeli military how many Palestinians he had killed.³

In 2016, the Jewish publication *The Algemeiner* ranked Columbia first on its list of the 40 worst colleges for Jewish students in the U.S. or Canada, writing that “[d]ozens of antisemitic and anti-Israel incidents, including protests and walk-outs of events related to the Jewish state, have taken place at Columbia.”⁴ In 2019, the nonprofit antisemitism watchdog group Alums for Campus Fairness released a dossier on Columbia titled “A Hotbed of Hate,” chronicling dozens of antisemitic incidents.⁵ The dossier identified Columbia and Barnard as “arguably the most prominent settings for university-based antisemitism in the United States.”⁶ A December 2023 Brandeis University research study that surveyed Jewish students at 51 campuses in the wake of the October 7, 2023, terrorist attack ranked Columbia in its worst category, “Highest antisemitic hostility.”⁷

Following numerous antisemitic incidents in the aftermath of the October 7 attack, Columbia suspended its campus chapters of the anti-Israel groups Students for Justice in Palestine (SJP) and Jewish Voice for Peace (JVP) on November 10, 2023. However, the groups have continued to hold anti-Israel events on campus with apparent impunity.⁸

The pattern of deeply troubling incidents and developments at Columbia includes the following:

² In the documentary, a student alleged that Professor of Arabic and Islamic Science George Saliba told her “[y]ou have no claim to the land of Israel. You have no voice in this debate. You have green eyes. You’re not a Semite. I have brown eyes. I am a Semite.” See: John Fund, *High Bias*, WALL STREET JOURNAL (Nov. 22, 2004), <https://www.wsj.com/articles/SB122487860271467459>.

³ Senior, *supra* note 1. The documentary detailed how Massad yelled at a Jewish student who questioned his views, “[i]f you’re going to deny the atrocities being committed against Palestinians, then you can get out of my classroom!” Although Massad “emphatically denied” this, an official inquiry by Columbia found that other student eyewitnesses corroborated the account and concluded that Massad’s response “exceeded commonly accepted bounds.” Columbia’s inquiry also corroborated an account that when a student identified himself as a veteran of the Israeli military at a lecture, Massad repeatedly asked him “[h]ow many Palestinians have you killed?” Despite these findings, Columbia granted Massad tenure in 2009, prompting a letter of protest from 14 faculty members who alleged irregularities in the tenure process. See: Ad Hoc Grievance Committee Report, COLUMBIA NEWS (Mar. 28, 2005), https://web.archive.org/web/20060209184005/http://www.columbia.edu/cu/news/05/03/ad_hoc_grievance_committee_report.html; Alix Pianin, *Professors protest Massad’s tenure*, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (Sep. 22, 2009), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/2009/09/22/professors-protest-massads-tenure/>.

⁴ *The 40 Worst Colleges for Jewish Students, 2016*, THE ALGEMEINER, <https://www.algemeiner.com/list/the-40-worst-colleges-for-jewish-students-2016/columbia-university/>.

⁵ ALUMS FOR CAMPUS FAIRNESS, A HOTBED FOR HATE; A COMPREHENSIVE DOSSIER OF ANTISEMITISM AT COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY AND BARNARD COLLEGE SINCE THE 2016-17 ACADEMIC YEAR (Oct. 20, 2019), <https://campusfairness.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/dossier-1.pdf>.

⁶ *Id.*

⁷ Graham Wright, et al., *In the Shadow of War: Hotspots of Antisemitism on US College Campuses* (Dec. 14, 2023), <https://scholarworks.brandeis.edu/esploro/outputs/report/9924312184701921>.

⁸ Haley Cohen, *Suspended groups at Columbia University continue to hold anti-Israel campus events*, JEWISH INSIDER (Dec. 12, 2023), <https://jewishinsider.com/2023/12/columbia-university-anti-israel-protests-sjp-jvp/>.

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
 February 12, 2024
 Page 3 of 16

- There have been numerous incidents of antisemitic assaults, harassment, and vandalism at Columbia:
 - An Israeli undergraduate who spoke in support of Israel at an October 10, 2023, rally subsequently received numerous harassing phone calls and texts, including messages saying “YOU'RE [*sic*] THE TERRORIST,” and “[h]ad fun with those crocodile tears bitch?”⁹
 - In the early morning hours of October 11, 2023, an individual outside Columbia’s main library began yelling “free Palestine!” at an Israeli undergraduate wearing a Star of David necklace. The individual told the undergraduate he was yelling “because you are a Jew” and pointed to the Star of David. According to multiple eyewitnesses, the individual then yelled “fuck the Jews” multiple times.¹⁰
 - On October 11, 2023, an Israeli Columbia student was beaten with a stick by a former Columbia undergraduate whom the victim had confronted about ripping down flyers of Israeli hostages. The assailant shouted, “Fuck you. Fuck all you prick crackers.”¹¹ The perpetrator was prosecuted for multiple criminal charges, including second-degree and third-degree assault, both charged as hate crimes.¹²
 - At an October 12, 2023, anti-Israel protest by Columbia’s chapters of SJP and JVP, students chanted “from the river to the sea” and held a “die-in.”¹³ Following the rally, the crowd of protestors moved toward the university’s Kraft Center for Jewish Life, causing the building to be locked down and Jewish students to shelter inside. During the protest, a Jewish student wearing an Israeli flag was yelled at and called a “murderer,” while another Jewish student leaving the protest had an Israeli flag he was wearing torn off and thrown down a subway staircase.¹⁴
 - On October 19, 2023, a Columbia student yelled “fuck the Jews” at a Jewish law student wearing a yarmulke inside Columbia’s law school building. The university reportedly identified the perpetrator but had not taken any action as of

⁹ Rebecca Massel, ‘I am a target’: Dozens of Jewish students report feeling unsafe on campus, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (Nov. 2, 2023), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2023/11/02/i-am-a-target-dozens-of-jewish-students-report-feeling-unsafe-on-campus/>.

¹⁰ *Id.*

¹¹ Isabella Ramirez, Former student faces hate crime charges from DA, granted supervised release after allegedly assaulting General Studies student, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (Oct. 16, 2023), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2023/10/16/former-student-faces-hate-crime-charges-from-da-granted-supervised-release-after-allegedly-assaulting-general-studies-student/>.

¹² *Id.*

¹³ Isabella Ramirez, et al., Hundreds of protesters pack campus following escalation of violence in Israel and Gaza, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (Oct. 12, 2023), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2023/10/12/hundreds-of-protesters-pack-campus-following-escalation-of-violence-in-israel-and-gaza/>.

¹⁴ Massel, *supra* note 9.

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
 February 12, 2024
 Page 4 of 16

October 30.¹⁵

- On October 19, 2023, Student Workers of Columbia – United Auto Workers Local 2710, which represents over 3,000 undergraduate and graduate student workers at Columbia, issued a statement saying, “we stand in solidarity with the Palestinian people” and “affirm their right to self-determination and freedom from apartheid.”¹⁶ The statement condemned what it called “75 years of Israeli settler-colonial rule” and “dehumanizing, unsupported claims of Israeli victimhood.”¹⁷ The union represents teaching assistants and instructors in positions of authority over Jewish and Israeli students.
- On October 20, 2023, the president of the student group LionLez sent an email promoting a screening of Black lesbian films with the message, “[i]t’s FREE PALESTINE over here. Zionists aren’t invited.”¹⁸ In an October 21, 2023, email reply to a student urging the group to remain neutral on the conflict, LionLez’s president wrote, “white Jewish people are today and always have been the oppressors of all brown people,” “WHEN I SAY THE HOLOCAUST WASN’T SPECIAL, I MEAN THAT,” and “Israelites are the Nazis.”¹⁹ The email was signed, “STOP THE GENOCIDE! FREE PALESTINE! FUCK ISRAEL.”²⁰
- On October 24, 2023, an undergraduate veteran of the Israel Defense Forces was protesting on campus alongside other students holding a sign that said, “Columbia doesn’t care about the safety and wellbeing of Jewish students.” An individual walking by yelled “[f]uck Israel.” When a student responded that the poster was about Jews, not Israel, the individual responded, “[f]uck the Jews.”²¹
- On October 27, 2023, a swastika was found drawn on a bathroom wall in Columbia’s School of International and Public Affairs building.²²

¹⁵ Jack Morphet & Jesse O’Neill, *Jewish Columbia students slam university’s ‘inaction’ against antisemitism: ‘I don’t feel safe’*, N.Y. POST (Oct. 30, 2023), <https://nypost.com/2023/10/30/metro/jewish-columbia-students-slam-universitys-inaction-against-antisemitism/>.

¹⁶ Student Workers of Columbia, Statement of Solidarity with Palestine (Oct. 16, 2023), https://drive.google.com/file/d/1-PxBvat_0SMvsExBeLSO9hzELLp6TJ8E/view.

¹⁷ *Id.*

¹⁸ Isabella Ramirez & Rebecca Massel, *LionLez President comes under fire for viral email*, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (October 27, 2023), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2023/10/27/lionlez-president-comes-under-fire-for-viral-email/>.

¹⁹ *Id.*

²⁰ *Id.*

²¹ Massel, *supra* note 9.

²² Daksha Pillai, *Swastika found drawn in International Affairs Building restroom*, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (OCT. 30, 2023), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2023/10/30/swastika-found-drawn-in-international-affairs-building-restroom/>.

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
 February 12, 2024
 Page 5 of 16

- On November 9, 2023, a student shouted “fuck the Jews” at a Jewish student wearing a yarmulke in the kosher section of a campus dining hall.²³
- On January 23, 2024, Columbia Law School’s Student Senate denied recognition to a proposed student organization called Law Students Against Antisemitism. According to the *Columbia Spectator*, nine organizations have requested recognition this year, and Law Students Against Antisemitism has been the only one not to receive approval.²⁴
- On January 31, 2024, posters appeared across campus with an image of a blue and white skunk with a Star of David on its back and the captions “Beware! Skunk on Campus” and “brought to you in collaboration by Columbia University and the IOF [Israeli Occupation Forces].”²⁵
- Following the October 7 attack, social media platforms were flooded with antisemitic messages by Columbia students. To provide several representative examples:
 - An October 28, 2023, post on the anonymous messaging platform Sidechat, which requires a Columbia e-mail address to access, expressed hope that “any IDF veterans” at Columbia “die a slow death,” including a student currently serving in Gaza who was identified by name.²⁶
 - A November 6, 2023, Sidechat post stated, “say it with me: FUCK ISRAEL” and a reply stated “[f]uck the Jews.”²⁷
 - A November 8, 2023, Sidechat post stated, “wish we had some way to indicate zionists and the zionist supporting shops in morningside so we can actively avoid them and not give them our business...perhaps with a star of david from the israeli flag?”²⁸
 - A November 12, 2023, Sidechat post stated “[i]dk why I even engage with Zionists, their stupidity literally gives me migraines.” When a

²³ Rebecca Massel, *Antisemitism Is Infecting My College Campus — And So Many Others*, ROLLING STONE (Nov. 22, 2023) <https://www.rollingstone.com/politics/political-commentary/antisemitism-college-campuses-1234891263/>.

²⁴ Rebecca Massel, *Law School Student Senate denies approval of Law Students Against Antisemitism group*, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (Feb. 1, 2024), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2024/02/01/law-school-student-senate-denies-approval-of-law-students-against-antisemitism-group/>.

²⁵ Shai Davidai (@ShaiDavidai), TWITTER (Jan. 31, 2024, 9:45 PM), <https://twitter.com/ShaiDavidai/status/1752885796921622612>.

²⁶ Massel, *supra* note 9.

²⁷ SIDECHAT (Nov. 6, 2023).

²⁸ SIDECHAT (Nov. 8, 2023).

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
February 12, 2024
Page 6 of 16

commenter asked what the poster's "problem with Zionists" was and offered to discuss, the poster wrote back, "my problem is their existence."²⁹

- On January 19, 2024, Barnard College held an event titled "Toward a Beloved Community: A Day of Dialogue and Reflection," where one of the speakers invited by Barnard administrators was Dr. Hatem Bazian, a co-founder of the national organization Students for Justice in Palestine, who has a long history of antisemitic, anti-Israel, and pro-terrorism statements, including saying "it's about time we had an intifada in this country."³⁰ In 2017 Bazian's posting of antisemitic tweets, including an image of a stereotypical ultra-Orthodox Jew with the statement "I can now kill, rape, smuggle organs and steal the land of Palestinians," was condemned by the University of California, Berkeley, where Bazian serves as a lecturer.³¹
- Numerous Columbia faculty have made antisemitic remarks and statements of support for Palestinian terrorism both prior to and after the October 7, 2023, terrorist attack. Some of the most egregious examples include:
 - Professor of Modern Arab Politics Joseph Massad stands out for his lengthy record of antisemitic, anti-Israel, and pro-Hamas conduct:
 - The day after the October 7 terror attack, Massad wrote an article for the website *The Electronic Intifada* lauding the "innovative Palestinian resistance" and describing the attack with terms such as "astonishing," "awesome," "astounding," "incredible", and causing "jubilation and awe" He compared the "Palestinian resistance" to "Europeans resisting the Nazi occupation" and wondered whether the attack will be "the start of the Palestinian War of Liberation."³² Massad also referred to Israel as "cruel colonizers" and the Palestinian Authority as "the collaborator PA."³³ When contacted by press about the article, "Columbia repeatedly declined to comment on the matter."³⁴

²⁹ SIDECHAT (Nov. 12, 2023).

³⁰ Alana Goodman, *Columbia's Barnard College Defends Inclusion of Anti-Semitic Terror Defender in University's 'Day of Dialogue'*, THE WASHINGTON FREE BEACON (Jan. 23, 2024), <https://freebeacon.com/campus/columbia-defends-inclusion-of-anti-semitic-terror-defender-in-universitys-day-of-dialogue/>.

³¹ Stuart Winer, *Berkeley lecturer apologizes for retweet college condemned as anti-Semitic*, THE TIMES OF ISRAEL (Nov. 27, 2017), <https://www.timesofisrael.com/berkeley-lecturer-apologizes-for-retweet-college-condemned-as-anti-semitic/>.

³² Joseph Massad, *Just another battle or the Palestinian war of liberation?*, THE ELECTRONIC INTIFADA (Oct. 8, 2023), <https://electronicintifada.net/content/just-another-battle-or-palestinian-war-liberation/38661>.

³³ *Id.*

³⁴ DeSheania Andrews, et al., *Columbia University refuses to condemn professor who called Hamas attack 'awesome'*, N.Y. POST (Oct. 16, 2023), <https://nypost.com/2023/10/16/columbia-university-refuses-to-comment-on-growing-furor-over-professor-who-called-hamas-attack-awesome/>.

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
 February 12, 2024
 Page 7 of 16

- Massad has repeatedly used hateful language delegitimizing Israel and deployed antisemitic tropes. Several representative examples include calling foreign volunteers joining the Israeli military “baby-killing Zionist Jewish volunteers for Israeli Jewish supremacy,”³⁵ labeling Israelis “cruel and bloodthirsty colonisers,” and saying Zionism is a “genocidal cult.”³⁶
- Hamid Dabashi, Columbia’s Hagop Kevorkian Professor of Iranian Studies and Comparative Literature, has made numerous virulently antisemitic statements:
 - On November 12, 2023, Dabashi wrote, “[b]efore 7 October, there was 6 October, and before that was a succession of dates and facts in a murderous colonial project of domination and dispossession going back to the Nakba, or catastrophe, of 1948” and “[i]f you are a Zionist, you believe in a racist, apartheid state. Period.”³⁷
 - Instances of Dabashi’s lengthy record of antisemitic comments abound. Here are four representative examples: In May 2018, Dabashi wrote, “[e]very dirty treacherous ugly and pernicious act happening in the world just wait for a few days and the ugly name of ‘Israel’ will pup [*sic*] up as a key actor in the atrocities.”³⁸ In April 2015, Dabashi called the American Israel Public Affairs Committee “the Fifth Column of the Israeli settler colony in the US.”³⁹ In August 2014, Dabashi wrote, “[f]rom now on, every time any Israeli, every time any Jew, anywhere in the world, utters the word ‘Auschwitz’, or the word ‘Holocaust’, the world will hear ‘Gaza.’”⁴⁰ In 2004, Dabashi wrote that Israelis have “a vulgarity of character that is bone-deep and structural to the skeletal vertebrae of its culture.”⁴¹

³⁵ Joseph Massad, *Jewish volunteers for racial supremacy in Palestine*, THE ELECTRONIC INTIFADA (Aug. 4, 2014), <https://electronicintifada.net/content/jewish-volunteers-racial-supremacy-palestine/13695>.

³⁶ Joseph Massad, *How Israel’s war on Gaza exposed Zionism as a genocidal cult*, MIDDLE EAST EYE (Jan. 11, 2024), <https://www.middleeasteye.net/opinion/how-israels-war-gaza-exposed-zionism-genocidal-cult>.

³⁷ Hamid Dabashi, *Israel-Palestine war: Debunking Israel’s top 10 propaganda points*, MIDDLE EAST EYE (Nov. 12, 2023), <https://www.middleeasteye.net/opinion/-palestine-gaza-israel-debunking-top-ten-propaganda-points>.

³⁸ Hamad Dabashi, FACEBOOK (May 8, 2018), <https://web.archive.org/web/20180509153241/https://www.facebook.com/dabashi/posts/1787752684578336>.

³⁹ Hamad Dabashi (@HamidDabashi), TWITTER (Apr. 15, 2015), https://canarymission.cdnazur.com/image_gallery/Hamid_Dabashi_cm02ba_Twitter_Apr_15_2015_Stb98X.jpg.

⁴⁰ Hamid Dabashi, *Gaza: Poetry after Auschwitz*, ALJAZEERA (Aug. 8, 2014), <https://www.aljazeera.com/opinions/2014/8/8/gaza-poetry-after-auschwitz>.

⁴¹ Hamid Dabashi, *For a Fistful of Dust: A Passage to Palestine*, MASRESS (Sept. 9, 2004), <https://www.masress.com/en/ahramweekly/19213>.

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
February 12, 2024
Page 8 of 16

- In November 2023, a student of Israeli heritage at Columbia's Graduate School of Architecture, Planning and Preservation told the *Columbia Spectator* that after sharing that her family was from Israel, one professor asked her, "[s]o you must know a lot about settler colonialism. How do you feel about that?" and another professor said "[i]t's such a shame that your people survived just in order to perpetuate genocide."⁴²

Amidst the heightened scrutiny of the proliferation of antisemitism on its campus following the October 7, 2023, terrorist attack, Columbia suspended SJP and JVP on November 10, 2023, for numerous violations of university policy.⁴³ This rendered them ineligible to hold events on campus. However, the university has repeatedly failed to enforce this decision and has allowed these groups and others to hold unauthorized antisemitic, anti-Israel events without consequence.⁴⁴ This stands at odds with President Shafik's October 9, 2023, commitment that "our first priority has been to make sure everyone connected to Columbia is safe"⁴⁵ and Columbia's statement that "President Shafik has repeatedly said that we will not tolerate antisemitic actions and are moving forcefully against antisemitic threats, images, and other violations as they are reported."⁴⁶ Columbia has consistently allowed anti-Israel groups to violate university policies and shown its commitments on antisemitism to be hollow:

- On November 16, 2023, members of the Columbia Law Coalition for a Free Palestine occupied Columbia Law School's lobby for nearly three hours in an anti-Israel protest in violation of multiple university policies, disrupting classes using a megaphone. Disrupted students notified a Columbia administrator, who eventually asked the protestors to go outside, but failed to remove the demonstrators when they refused to leave.⁴⁷
- On December 6, 2023, Columbia Social Workers 4 Palestine occupied the lobby of the School of Social Work Building with an unauthorized teach-in titled "Significance of the

⁴² Massel, *supra* note 9.

⁴³ In addition to their recognized violations of university policy, Columbia's SJP and JVP chapters have espoused extreme anti-Israel, pro-Hamas views. On October 9, 2023, Columbia's chapters of SJP and JVP issued an open letter stating, "[w]e stand in full solidarity with Palestinian resistance." The letter called the October 7 terrorist attack "an unprecedented historic moment for the Palestinians of Gaza, who tore through the wall that has been suffocating them" and said "[d]espite the odds against them, Palestinians launched a counter-offensive against their settler-colonial oppressor."

⁴⁴ Gerald Rosberg, Statement From Gerald Rosberg, Chair of the Special Committee on Campus Safety (Nov. 10, 2023), <https://news.columbia.edu/news/statement-gerald-rosberg-chair-special-committee-campus-safety>; Cohen, *supra* note 8; Press Release, Colum. Jewish Alumni Ass'n, CJAA condemns antisemitic events organized by suspended student groups; calls for immediate action to enforce University policies (Jan. 2, 2024), <https://www.columbiajewishalumni.org/announcements/timeline-of-recent-events-at-columbia>.

⁴⁵ Minouche Shafik, Message of Concern for Our Community (Oct. 9, 2023), <https://president.columbia.edu/news/message-concern-our-community>.

⁴⁶ Event Policy and Campus Resources FAQ, COLUM. UNIV. OFF. OF PUB. AFF., <https://communications.news.columbia.edu/content/event-policy-and-campus-resources-faq>.

⁴⁷ Aaron Sibarum, *Columbia Administrators Stand By as Anti-Israel Protesters Overrun Law School and Disrupt Classes*, THE WASHINGTON FREE BEACON (Nov. 21, 2023), <https://freebeacon.com/campus/columbia-administrators-stand-by-as-anti-israel-protesters-overrun-law-school-and-disrupt-classes/>.

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
 February 12, 2024
 Page 9 of 16

October 7th Palestinian Counteroffensive.”⁴⁸ Advertisements for the event used images of an AK-47.⁴⁹ School of Social Work Dean Melissa Begg previously stated that the event had not been approved and that “CSSW supports free speech but does not condone language that promotes violence in any manner, which is antithetical to our values. This event will not go forward at CSSW.”⁵⁰ Yet, Columbia failed to stop or disperse the event from taking place, despite the presence of administrators and security, and instead restricted building access to student ID holders.⁵¹ An event speaker was quoted endorsing terrorism against Israel, saying that “[o]n October 7, the Palestinian Liberation fighters demonstrated their refusal to be dominated.”⁵²

- On December 7, 2023, SJP and JVP held a Chanukah menorah lighting ceremony comparing the terrorist attack against Israel to the Chanukah story in violation of their suspension. JVP’s Instagram page stated, “@SJP.Columbia will join us to meditate on the parallels between the Hanukkah story and current events, the importance of grassroots activism, and the significance of solidarity in the face of oppression and suppression.”⁵³
- On December 8, 2023, in violation of their suspension, SJP used a table reserved by another group to distribute anti-Israel pamphlets saying “[f]rom the river to the sea, Palestine will be free.”⁵⁴
- On December 12, 2023, SJP and JVP held an anti-Israel protest on Barnard’s campus in violation of their suspension, chanting “from the river to the sea” and “intifada, intifada, long live intifada.”⁵⁵ According to the Columbia Jewish Alumni Association, several Barnard deans passed by the event but failed to stop it, and at least one Jewish student was assaulted at it.⁵⁶

⁴⁸ Daskia Pillai & Sabrina Ticer-Wurr, *School of Social Work students hold ‘Palestinian Counteroffensive’ teach-in despite cancellation by administration*, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (Dec. 9, 2023), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2023/12/08/school-of-social-work-students-hold-palestinian-counteroffensive-teach-in-despite-cancellation-by-administration/>.

⁴⁹ *Id.*

⁵⁰ *Id.*

⁵¹ *Id.*; Gelila Negesse & Joseph Zuloaga, *School of Social Work students hold sit-in, University threatens academic sanctions*, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (Nov. 10, 2023), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2023/11/10/school-of-social-work-students-hold-sit-in-university-threatens-academic-sanctions/>.

⁵² Pillai & Ticer-Wurr, *supra* note 48.

⁵³ Cohen, *supra* note 8.

⁵⁴ *Id.*

⁵⁵ Chris Mendell, *SJP and JVP protest on Barnard’s campus to demand permanent ceasefire*, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (Dec. 12, 2023), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2023/12/11/sjp-and-jvp-protest-on-barnards-campus-to-demand-permanent-ceasefire/>; *Students Gather In “Barnard 4 Palestine” Emergency Protest*, BWOG (Dec. 12, 2023), <https://bwog.com/2023/12/students-gather-in-barnard-4-palestine-emergency-protest/>;

⁵⁶ Colum. Jewish Alumni Ass’n, *supra* note 44.

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
 February 12, 2024
 Page 10 of 16

- On January 19, 2024, Columbia University Apartheid Divest (CUAD), a coalition of anti-Israel student groups led by SJP and JVP,⁵⁷ held a rally on the steps of Columbia's main administrative building, Low Library, where they chanted, "there is only one solution, intifada revolution," "Yemen, Yemen make us proud, turn another ship around" (an endorsement of Houthi terrorism in the Red Sea), "from the river to the sea Palestine will be Arab," and "Minouche Shafik, can't you see, we are all SJP, we are all JVP."⁵⁸
- On January 24, 2024, student groups including SJP and JVP held an "emergency protest" and class walkout in violation of their suspension.⁵⁹
- On February 2, 2024, CUAD and the off-campus anti-Israel organization Within Our Lifetime held an "All Out for Palestine" rally on the street, immediately outside Columbia's gates. A Jewish Columbia undergraduate wearing a shirt with an Israeli flag on it was assaulted after leaving a pro-Israel counterprotest, being "slammed" into and pinned against a building by an anti-Israel protester in a keffiyeh.⁶⁰ After the Jewish student broke free and escaped, his assailant shouted, "[k]eep running, keep fucking running."⁶¹ Separately, the New York Police Department (NYPD) arrested three protesters and charged 12 with disorderly conduct. One of those arrested was a Columbia undergraduate charged with obstructing governmental administration in the second degree.⁶² Protestors chanted "Long Live the Intifada," "Settlers, Settlers Go Back Home – Palestine is Ours Alone," "NYPD, KKK. IDF they're all the same," and "NYPD, burn in hell!" Trucks also drove by with slogans including "'Israel is the new Nazi Germany" and "Israel steals Palestinian organs."⁶³

⁵⁷ Chris Mendell & Gelila Negesse, *Over 80 student groups form coalition following suspension of SJP, JVP*, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (Nov. 29, 2023), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2023/11/29/over-80-student-groups-form-coalition-following-suspension-of-sjp-jvp/>.

⁵⁸ Daksha Pillai, et al., *Pro-Palestinian student groups hold 'divestment now' rally on Low Steps, call for tuition strike*, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (Jan. 19, 2024), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2024/01/19/pro-palestinian-student-groups-hold-divestment-now-rally-on-low-steps-call-for-tuition-strike/>; *Hundreds call for intifada, hail Houthis at Columbia University anti-Israel protest*, THE TIMES OF ISRAEL (Jan. 20, 2024), <https://www.timesofisrael.com/hundreds-call-for-intifada-hail-houthis-at-columbia-university-anti-israel-protest/>.

⁵⁹ Sarah Huddleston, et al., *Students walk out in 'emergency protest' following alleged chemical spray at Friday demonstration*, COLUMBIA SPECTATOR (Jan. 24, 2024), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/news/2024/01/24/students-walk-out-in-emergency-protest-following-alleged-chemical-spray-at-friday-demonstration/>.

⁶⁰ Esha Karam, et al., *NYPD arrests three protesters, charges 12 with 'disorderly conduct' after pro-Palestinian rally that draws hundreds*, Columbia Spectator (Feb. 3, 2024), <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/city-news/2024/02/02/nypd-apprehends-several-pro-palestinian-protesters-at-rally-that-draws-hundreds/>.

⁶¹ *Id.*

⁶² Judy Maltz, *Denouncing Israel as 'The New Nazi Germany,' Hundreds Protest Outside Columbia University*, HAARETZ (Feb. 3, 2024), <https://www.haaretz.com/us-news/2024-02-03/ty-article/.premium/denouncing-israel-as-the-new-nazi-germany-hundreds-protest-outside-columbia-university/0000018d-7091-dd6e-a98d-f4b3eca80000>; Esha Karam, et al., *supra* note 60.

⁶³ Maltz, *supra* note 61.

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and
 Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
 February 12, 2024
 Page 11 of 16

A November 2, 2023, survey of over 50 Jewish students by the *Columbia Spectator* shows the devastating impact of antisemitism at Columbia. The survey found that “34 [students] reported feeling unsafe on campus since Hamas’ unexpected attack on Israel on Oct. 7. Thirteen students said that they personally experienced incidents where they felt attacked or harassed, either in-person or online...Twelve students said they tried to hide or veil their Jewish identity when walking around campus.”⁶⁴ Columbia’s failure to enforce its policies and uphold its commitments on antisemitism is a clear abdication of the university’s obligation to protect its Jewish students.

To assist the Committee in understanding antisemitism at Columbia and the university’s response to it, please produce the following items no later than February 26, 2024:

1. All reports of antisemitic acts or incidents and related documents and communications since January 1, 2021, including but not limited to all reports of antisemitic acts, incidents, or discrimination made to the following:
 - a. The Office of the President;
 - b. The Office of the General Counsel;
 - c. The Office of the Provost;
 - d. The University Senate;
 - e. The Columbia Office of University Life, Columbia Undergraduate Student Life, GS Student Life, and the Barnard Division of Campus Life and Student Experience;
 - f. Any Columbia offices focused on diversity, equity, and inclusion, including but not limited to: the Columbia College and Fu Foundation School of Engineering and Applied Science Office of Multicultural Affairs; Barnard Office of Diversity, Equity & Inclusion; Graduate School of Arts and Sciences Office of Academic Diversity and Inclusion; College of Physicians and Surgeons Office of Diversity and Multicultural Affairs; School of Social Work Office of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion; Mailman School of Public Health Office of Diversity, Culture, and Inclusion; Teacher’s College Office of the Vice President for Diversity and Community Affairs; College of Dental Medicine Office of Diversity Affairs; and School of Nursing Office of Diversity and Cultural Affairs;
 - g. The Columbia Department of Public Safety;

⁶⁴ Massel, *supra* note 9.

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and
Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
February 12, 2024
Page 12 of 16

- h. Any hotlines, inboxes, or other mechanisms that collect reports of bias, discrimination, and harassment;
 - i. Columbia University Human Resources;
- 2. Documents sufficient to show any Columbia disciplinary, academic, personnel, administrative, or other processes through which allegations of hate crimes, discrimination, bias, or harassment are responded to, including but not limited to, any written policies, procedures, guidance, handbooks, rubrics, and/or tables of penalties. Please also identify the offices, individuals, boards, and/or bodies that are responsible for evaluating and/or determining such responses, including the composition of any offices, boards, or bodies;
- 3. Documents sufficient to show Columbia's policies and procedures that ensure and preserve access to safe and uninterrupted learning environments and respond to and address reported violations, including through law enforcement, investigative, and disciplinary processes. Please also identify the offices, individuals, boards, and/or bodies that are responsible for evaluating and/or determining such responses, including the composition of any offices, boards, or bodies;
- 4. Documents sufficient to show the findings and results of any disciplinary processes, changes in academic status, or personnel actions by Columbia toward Columbia students, faculty, staff, and other Columbia affiliates related to conduct involving the targeting of Jews, Israelis, Israel, Zionists, or Zionism since January 1, 2021;
- 5. Documents sufficient to show the findings and results of any disciplinary processes or changes in status by Columbia toward Columbia student organizations related to conduct involving Jews, Israelis, Israel, Zionists, or Zionism since January 1, 2021, including, but not limited to Columbia Students for Justice in Palestine, Columbia-Barnard Jewish Voice for Peace, Columbia University Apartheid Divest, Columbia Law Students for Palestine, Columbia Social Workers 4 Palestine, and/or LionLez;
- 6. All documents and communications relating to or reflecting sources of funding for Columbia Students for Justice in Palestine, Columbia-Barnard Jewish Voice for Peace, Columbia University Apartheid Divest, Columbia Law Students for Palestine, and Columbia Social Workers 4 Palestine, and Faculty and Staff for Justice in Palestine, including, but not limited to university, departmental, faculty, and student organization funds, as well as foreign donations;
- 7. Documents sufficient to show findings and results of any disciplinary processes, changes in academic status, or personnel actions by Columbia toward Columbia students, faculty, staff, student organizations, and other Columbia affiliates as a result of the following:

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and
Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
February 12, 2024
Page 13 of 16

- a. Allegations of hate crimes, discrimination, bias, or harassment on the basis of religion, ethnicity, national origin, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, and disability at Columbia since January 1, 2021;
 - b. Reports of denial or disruption of access to safe and uninterrupted learning environments at Columbia since January 1, 2021;
8. All records of requests to conduct protests at Columbia, including their disposition, since October 7, 2023;
9. Documents sufficient to show any rejections of requested events or speakers at Columbia since January 1, 2021;
10. Documents sufficient to show any legal, financial, or informal settlements by Columbia in response to complaints of discrimination, harassment, or violations of free speech/expression since January 1, 2021;
11. All documents and communications since January 1, 2021, referring and relating to antisemitism, involving the Office of the President, Office of the Provost, and/or University Senate;
12. All Columbia Board of Trustees meeting minutes and/or summaries, whether formal or informal, since January 1, 2021, including minutes of meetings of any components, such as committees, executive committees, subcommittees, and/or task forces;
13. All documents and communications since January 1, 2021, referring and relating to antisemitism, involving the Columbia Board of Trustees (including all members);
14. Any meeting minutes, circulated materials, and/or readouts from Columbia's Task Force on Antisemitism, and documents sufficient to show any findings and recommendations by the Task Force and any responses and reactions to such findings and recommendations by the President, Provost, deans of Columbia's various schools, and the staffs of the aforementioned university officials;
15. Documents sufficient to show any changes to Columbia's governance documents and codes of conduct made since October 7, 2023;
16. All documents and communications, including, but not limited to those involving the Office of the President, Office of the Provost, Department of Public Safety, Columbia's undergraduate and graduate/professional schools, Columbia University Human Resources, and/or any other entities responsible for investigating and determining consequences for misconduct and violations of university standards, referring and relating to:

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and
Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
February 12, 2024
Page 14 of 16

- a. The activities of Columbia Students for Justice in Palestine, Columbia-Barnard Jewish Voice for Peace, Columbia University Apartheid Divest, Columbia Law Students for Palestine, and/or Columbia Social Workers 4 Palestine since October 7, 2023;
 - b. Posts by Columbia students, faculty, staff, and other Columbia affiliates on Sidechat and other social media platforms targeting Jews, Israelis, Israel, Zionists, or Zionism;
 - c. Anti-Israel protests at Columbia since October 7, 2023, and any assaults, harassment, and other disruptions to education and student life related to them; including but not limited to the October 12, 2023, December 12, 2023, January 19, 2024, January 24, 2024, January 29, 2024, and February 2, 2024 protests and the December 6, 2023, teach-in at the School of Social Work;
 - d. The October 11, 2023, assault of an Israeli Columbia student;
 - e. Antisemitic slurs directed at Columbia students, faculty, staff, and any other affiliates since October 7, 2023, including but not limited to those directed at an Israeli student outside Columbia's library on October 11, 2023, a Jewish Columbia Law student on October 19, 2023, an Israeli Columbia student on October 24, 2023, and a Jewish student in a campus dining hall on November 9, 2023;
 - f. The antisemitic vandalization of Columbia's School of International and Public Affairs building on or about October 27, 2023;
 - g. The destruction or unauthorized removal of posters featuring Israeli hostages abducted by Hamas;
 - h. Allegations of antisemitic conduct and/or discrimination against Jewish or Israeli Columbia students by Columbia faculty and/or staff since January 1, 2001;
17. All documents and communications, including but not limited to those involving the Office of the President, Office of the Provost, undergraduate and graduate/professional school administrations, and/or any academic departments, programs, and centers, referring or relating to any efforts by Columbia students, faculty, and staff to engage in the Boycott, Divestment, and Sanctions movement against Israel since January 1, 2021, and communications by Columbia administrators relating to such efforts;
18. All products of diversity, equity, and inclusion offices and programs, and similar offices and programs from any Columbia components, since January 1, 2020, relating to Jews and/or antisemitism, including but not limited to reports, publications, presentations,

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and
Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
February 12, 2024
Page 15 of 16

personal or professional development materials, guidance, and other related materials;

19. Documents sufficient to show the mandate, size, budget, agenda, and performance metrics of all diversity, equity, and inclusion offices and programs, or any similar offices and programs from any Columbia components, including documents sufficient to show any updates to the mandate, size, budget, agenda, or performance metrics of such offices since October 7, 2023;
20. Documents sufficient to show all Columbia policies concerning the acceptance and rejection of donations from foreign sources, including Columbia's policies concerning:
 - a. faculty and staff receiving and disclosing donations and funding from foreign sources;
 - b. donations and funding from foreign sources being directed toward academic departments, programs, and centers;
21. Documents sufficient to show the annual total amount of foreign donations and funding (including but not limited to governmental bodies, nongovernmental organizations, and private individuals) to Columbia since January 1, 2021, by country;
22. Documents sufficient to show all foreign donations and funding (including but not limited to governmental bodies, nongovernmental organizations, and private individuals) to Columbia of \$50,000 or more since January 1, 2021;
23. Documents sufficient to show all donations and funding to Columbia from Qatari sources (including but not limited to the Qatar Foundation, governmental bodies, nongovernmental organizations whether incorporated in Qatar or elsewhere, and private individuals) since January 1, 2021;
24. Documents sufficient to show any data since January 1, 2003, showing or relating to Jewish enrollment numbers at Columbia's undergraduate colleges (including Barnard) and each of its graduate and professional schools, any changes or trends in the enrollment of Jewish students at Columbia's undergraduate colleges and graduate/professional schools, documents related to any attempt by Columbia's administration, undergraduate colleges (including the undergraduate Office of Admissions), and each of Columbia's graduate and professional schools to understand the reasons for any such changes or trends; and
25. All documents and communications involving the Office of the President, the Office of the Provost, dean's offices at each of Columbia's undergraduate and graduate/professional schools, Columbia's undergraduate Office of Admissions and each admissions unit of Columbia's graduate/professional schools, and the Columbia Board of Trustees since January 1, 2013, relating to recruitment, admission, enrollment, and

Dr. Minouche Shafik, Dr. Laura Rosenbury, Mr. David Greenwald, Ms. Claire Shipman, and
Ms. Cheryl Glicker Milstein
February 12, 2024
Page 16 of 16

retention of Jewish students.⁶⁵

Congress' oversight powers are derived from the U.S. Constitution and have been affirmed repeatedly by the United States Supreme Court.⁶⁶ Under House Rule X, the Committee has legislative and oversight jurisdiction over "education or labor generally."⁶⁷

Please see the attached instructions for relevant definitions and other directions for the production of documents. This request encompasses responsive materials in the possession of not only Columbia faculty, staff, students, and other affiliates but also individual members of the Columbia Board of Trustees. The request also extends to any informal communications such as texts or other electronic messages. I expect that this request will be conveyed promptly to all parties who would be reasonably expected to have responsive materials.

If you have any questions about this request, please contact Ari Wisch of the Committee staff at 202-225-4527 or ari.wisch@mail.house.gov.

Sincerely,



Virginia Foxx
Chairwoman
Committee on Education and the Workforce

⁶⁵ For the avoidance of doubt, the Committee is not seeking the application materials of individual applicants and students.

⁶⁶ *See generally* U.S. CONST. art. I, § 8, cl. 8; *McGrain v. Daugherty*, 273 U.S. 135, 174 (1927) (holding that "the power of inquiry—with process to enforce it—is an essential and appropriate auxiliary to the legislative function"); *Eastland v. U.S. Servicemen's Fund*, 421 U.S. 491, 504 (1975) (holding that "the power to investigate is inherent in the power to make laws"); *Barenblatt v. United States*, 360 U.S. 109, 111 (1959) (holding that "the scope of power of inquiry ... is as penetrating and far-reaching as the potential power to enact and appropriate under the Constitution.").

⁶⁷ *Rules of the House of Representatives: One Hundred Eighteenth Congress*, U.S. HOUSE OF REP. 7 (Jan. 10, 2023), <https://rules.house.gov/sites/republicans.rules118.house.gov/files/documents/Rules%20and%20Resources/118-House-Rules-Clerk.pdf>.